



## Libertarian Presidential Candidate Spending Analysis – Bob Barr

**Total Annual Spending: -\$200.928 billion**

Table 1. Summary by Category					
Category	Annualized Cost (in Millions)	Total Cost (in Millions)	# of Proposals	# of Proposals with a Cost Estimate	# Proposals with Unknown Cost
Economy, Transportation, and Infrastructure	(\$8,151)	(\$8,151)	1	1	0
Education, Science, and Research	(\$68,046)	(\$68,046)	1	1	0
Energy, Agriculture, and the Environment	(\$31,782)	(\$31,782)	4	3	1
Health Care	(\$520)	(\$2,600)	2	1	1
Homeland Security and Law Enforcement	\$4	\$20	2	1	1
National Defense and International Relations	(\$92,400)	(\$462,000)	3	1	2
Miscellaneous	(\$33)	(\$33)	6	1	5
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>(\$200,928)</b>	<b>(\$572,592)</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>10</b>

Table 2. Summary of Proposals by Category				
Category	Program	Annualized Cost (in Millions)	Total Cost (in Millions)	# of Years
Economy, Transportation, and Infrastructure	A. Department of Commerce	(\$8,151)	(\$8,151)	1
Economy, Transportation, and Infrastructure Total		<b>(\$8,151)</b>	<b>(\$8,151)</b>	
Education, Science, and Research	A. Department of Education	(\$68,046)	(\$68,046)	1
Education, Science, and Research Total		<b>(\$68,046)</b>	<b>(\$68,046)</b>	
Energy, Agriculture, and the Environment	A. Department of Energy	(\$23,029)	(\$23,029)	1
	B. Farm Aid	(\$8,153)	(\$8,153)	1
	C. Oil Exploration and Drilling	(\$600)	(\$600)	5
	D. Oil Shale Exploration and Drilling	Unknown.	Unknown.	N/A
Energy, Agriculture, and the Environment Total		<b>(\$31,782)</b>	<b>(\$31,782)</b>	
Health Care	A. Health Care for Illegal Aliens	Unknown.	Unknown.	N/A
	B. Medicare Benefits	(\$520)	(\$2,600)	5
Health Care Total		<b>(\$520)</b>	<b>(\$2,600)</b>	
Homeland Security and Law Enforcement	A. Border Security and Enforcement	Unknown.	Unknown.	N/A
	B. Office of Privacy and Civil Liberties	\$4	\$20	5

<b>Homeland Security and Law Enforcement Total</b>		<b>\$4</b>	<b>\$20</b>	
<b>National Defense and International Relations</b>	A. Iraq	(\$92,400)	(\$462,000)	5
	B. Military Overseas Basing	Unknown.	Unknown.	N/A
	C. United Nations (UN)	Unknown.	Unknown.	N/A
<b>National Defense and International Relations Total</b>		<b>(\$92,400)</b>	<b>(\$462,000)</b>	
<b>Miscellaneous</b>	A. Benefits for Immigrants	Unknown.	Unknown.	N/A
	B. English as National Language	Unknown.	Unknown.	N/A
	C. Entitlement Programs	Unknown.	Unknown.	N/A
	D. Federal Government – Executive Office of the President	(\$33)	(\$33)	1
	E. Tax Reform	Unknown.	Unknown.	N/A
	F. Welfare	Unknown.	Unknown.	N/A
<b>Miscellaneous Total</b>		<b>(\$33)</b>	<b>(\$33)</b>	
<b>Grand Total</b>		<b>(\$200,928)</b>	<b>(\$572,592)</b>	

### **Economy, Transportation, and Infrastructure: -\$8.151 billion**

#### **A. Department of Commerce:**

“[Will S. Hylton]: So you would eliminate the Department of Education. Are there any other departments you would eliminate?”

[Barr]: I find it very hard to understand why we have a Department of Commerce. There might need to be an office that carries out certain functions to ensure free commerce, but that could be handled by the Department of Justice.”

<http://men.style.com/gq/blogs/gqeditors/2008/06/give-him-libert.html>

Cost: -\$8.151 billion (*savings*) (first-year cost).

Source: FY 2008 outlays for the Department of Commerce. *Historical Tables, Budget of the United States Government: Fiscal Year 2009*, page 79.

<http://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/budget/fy2009/pdf/hist.pdf>

Note: This estimate assumes immediate defunding of the Department of Commerce.

### **Education, Science, and Research: -\$68.046 billion**

#### **A. Department of Education:**

“The Department [of Education] should be closed down and the money left with the American people to use for education at the family, local, and state levels.”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press-releases/34/give-parents-a-choice-in-education-says-bob-barr/>

Cost: -\$68.046 billion (*savings*) (first-year cost).

Source: FY 2008 outlays for the Department of Education. *Historical Tables, Budget of the United States Government: Fiscal Year 2009*, page 79.  
<http://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/budget/fy2009/pdf/hist.pdf>

Note: This estimate assumes immediate defunding of the Department of Education.

## **Energy, Agriculture, and the Environment: -\$31.782 billion**

### **A. Department of Energy:**

“[I would eliminate] ... the Department of Energy.”  
<http://men.style.com/gq/blogs/gqeditors/2008/06/give-him-libert.html>

Cost: -\$23.209 billion (*savings*) (first-year cost).  
Source: FY 2008 outlays for the Department of Energy. *Historical Tables, Budget of the United States Government: Fiscal Year 2009*, page 79.  
<http://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/budget/fy2009/pdf/hist.pdf>

Note: This estimate assumes that the Department of Energy would be immediately defunded.

### **B. Farm Aid:**

“Absolutely, I would [cut farm aid]. Something like ... 54 percent, that is well more than half of farm subsidies ... .”  
<http://transcripts.cnn.com/TRANSCRIPTS/0805/14/gb.01.html>

Cost: -\$8.153 billion (*savings*) (first-year cost).  
Source: In FY 2008, the federal government spent \$16.305 billion for farm income stabilization. *Historical Tables, Budget of the United States Government: Fiscal Year 2009*, page 61.  
<http://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/budget/fy2009/pdf/hist.pdf>

### **C. Oil Exploration and Drilling:**

“Explore ANWR and Outer Continental Shelf. ... The United States has large energy deposits within its own borders and off its shores. It is time for America to develop those resources to benefit the American people.  
<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press-releases/30/explore-anwr-and-outer-continental-shelf-says-bob-barr/>

Cost: -\$600 million (*savings*) (-\$3.002 billion over five years).  
Source: Congressional Budget Office (CBO), *Budget Options*, February 2007, page 69.

<http://www.cbo.gov/doc.cfm?index=7821&type=1>

Note: CBO scores the revenues from this activity as offsetting receipts. This estimate is only for the estimated receipts from leases in ANWR. An estimate for other new areas of oil exploration is unavailable.

#### D. Oil Shale Exploration and Drilling:

“Relaxing restrictions on development will grow even more important in the future, as it becomes feasible to develop unconventional petroleum resources. For instance, deposits of oil shale could yield nearly two trillion barrels of recoverable petroleum.”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press-releases/18/cut-gas-prices-by-developing-america%e2%80%99s-energy-resources-says-bob-barr/>

Cost: Unknown.

Note: If the deposits are on federal land, leasing arrangements could generate savings in the form of offsetting receipts to the Treasury.

#### **Health Care: -\$520 million**

##### A. Health Care for Illegal Aliens:

“[The government] must stop requiring hospital emergency rooms to provide free care for illegal aliens . . . .”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press/press-releases/72/bob-barr-criticizes-barack-obama-plan-to-provide-health-insurance-for-illegal-aliens/>

Cost: Unknown.

Note: This could possibly lead to savings if emergency payments by the federal government to border-state hospitals are reduced or eliminated. The Medicare Prescription Drug Improvement, and Modernization Act of 2003 (passed into law during the 108<sup>th</sup> Congress) provided \$250 million a year over 2005-2008 for payments to hospitals to offset their cost for providing urgent care for illegal immigrants. The authority for this program is set to expire this year. H.R. 6394 (110<sup>th</sup> Congress) would extend the program through 2012.

##### B. Medicare Benefits:

“As for Medicaid, Medicare, and Social Security, government must emphasize private choice in health care and private retirement accounts. Benefits also should be adjusted to reflect changing demographics as the Baby Boom generation retires, and to emphasize care for those most in need.”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/issues/entitlement-programs/>

Cost: -\$520 million (*savings*) (-\$2.6 billion over five years).

Source: Related legislation has been introduced in the form of S. 2662 (110<sup>th</sup> Congress), the Medicare Funding Warning Response Act of 2008. Cost is derived from a CBO estimate for the portion of S. 2662 pertaining to Medicare Part D subsidies for higher-income individuals.  
<http://www.cbo.gov/ftpdocs/90xx/doc9051/s2662.pdf>

## **Homeland Security and Law Enforcement: \$4 million**

### **A. Border Security and Enforcement:**

“The federal government ... must regain control over the nation’s border. Only then will the U.S. be able to deal with threats of terrorism and infectious diseases, as well as implement a consistent immigration policy. Effective enforcement is more important than a physical fence.”

Cost: Unknown.

### **B. Office of Privacy and Civil Liberties:**

“As President [Barr] would establish in the Executive Office of the President a new office tasked with tracking and reviewing legislative and regulatory threats to privacy and civil liberties ... this new Office of Privacy and Civil Liberties would monitor executive branch activities and legislative proposals for their impact on the freedoms of Americans ... .”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press/press-releases/45/bob-barr-promises-to-create-white-house-position-to-defend-privacy-and-civil-liberties/>

Cost: \$4 million (\$20 million over five years).

Source: This estimate is based on the budget of a related entity within the Executive Office of the President, the Office of Science and Technology Policy, which received \$4 million in 2007.

<http://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/budget/fy2008/pdf/appendix/eop.pdf>

## **National Defense and International Relations: -\$92.4 billion**

### **A. Iraq:**

“The next president should commit to a speedy and complete withdrawal from Iraq and tell the Iraqi people that the U.S. troops will be going home.”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press-releases/14/tell-iraqis-no-permanent-bases-says-bob-barr/>

Cost: -\$92.4 billion (*savings*) (-\$462 billion over five years).

Source: In September, 2008, CBO projected an estimate for a scenario under which the number of troops deployed for military operations in Iraq and

Afghanistan and other activities related to the War on Terrorism are reduced to 30,000 by 2011. This 30,000 figure approximates the number of troops the United States currently has deployed in Afghanistan. Congressional Budget Office, *The Budget and Economic Outlook: An Update*, September, 2008.  
<http://www.cbo.gov/ftpdocs/97xx/doc9706/09-08-Update.pdf>

#### B. Military Overseas Basing:

“Washington can bring home troops stationed in not only South Korea, but also Europe and Japan.”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press-releases/21/time-to-remove-troops-from-south-korea-says-bob-barr/>

“In defending America’s presence in Iraq, Sen. McCain said it didn’t matter that U.S. troops were still in Germany, Japan, and South Korea, decades after those nations were at war: ‘That’s all fine,’ McCain declared. But it isn’t all fine. U.S. taxpayers should not be forced to pay to defend wealthy nations that are able to defend themselves.”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press-releases/26/bob-barr-tells-john-mccain-america-is-not-an-occupying-power/>

Cost: Unknown.

Note: It would take some time to plan and implement this policy. The savings could be significant but would require a large up-front investment. For example, according to a Congressional Research Service report, in 2004 the Bush administration proposed to “establish new overseas operating sites, and transfer up to 70,000 U.S. troops, plus 100,000 family members and civilians, from Europe and Asia back to the United States. ...

There would be limited annual savings to offset the large initial investment needed to restation U.S. forces, unless U.S. presence overseas was greatly reduced. In that case, annual savings could exceed \$1 billion, but the net up-front investment would be substantial – on the order of \$7 billion.”

<http://www.fas.org/man/crs/RS21975.pdf>

#### C. United Nations (U.N.):

“The U.S. should push to roll back the UN’s functions and slash America’s financial contribution.”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press/press-releases/37/bob-barr-says-us-must-cut-united-nations-role-and-budget/>

Cost: Unknown.

Note: It is unclear how much Barr would “slash” the United Nations’ budget. Total United States funding for international organizations and U.N. peacekeeping activities in FY 2008 is \$3.686 billion (including supplemental appropriations). *Appendix, Budget of the United States Government: Fiscal Year*

2009, “International Organizations and Conferences,” and “Contributions for International Peacekeeping Activities.”

<http://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/budget/fy2009/pdf/appendix/sta.pdf>

### **Miscellaneous: -\$33 million**

#### **A. Benefits for Immigrants:**

“... [W]e must eliminate government benefits for immigrants.”

<http://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2008/sep/06/border-first/>

Cost: Unknown.

Note: A campaign spokesman clarified that this quote was in reference to illegal immigrants.

A study from the Center for Immigration Studies used 2002 data to estimate the cost on the federal government by households headed by illegal aliens. The costs resulting from direct benefit payments included Medicaid, \$2.5 billion; care for the uninsured, \$2.2 billion; and, food assistance programs, \$1.9 billion. A more recent estimate is unavailable.

<http://www.cis.org/articles/2004/fiscaltranscript.html>

#### **B. English as National Language:**

“English should be America’s official language. ... [G]overnment business should be transacted in English. Congress should scrap bilingual ballots.”

<http://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2008/sep/06/border-first/>

Cost: Unknown.

Note: There are likely to be savings from this proposal, but the amount is difficult to determine: “Although at this point we are unable to endorse as accurate any single summation of [Limited-English Proficiency]-associated costs across all government or government-funded services, we suspect that the number may be less than \$2 billion, and perhaps less than \$1 billion.” Office of Management and Budget, *Report to Congress: Assessment of the Total Benefits and Costs of Implementing Executive Order No. 13166: Improving Access to Services for Persons with Limited English Proficiency*, March 14, 2002.

<http://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/inforeg/lepfinal3-14.pdf>

#### **C. Entitlement Programs:**

“‘Reforming [Social Security and Medicare] while keeping faith with the elderly will not be easy,’ Barr warns. But new legislation introduced by Rep. Paul Ryan (R-WI) ‘offers a good starting point to put America’s fiscal house in order,’ [Barr] says. Ryan’s four-part package would simplify the tax code, allow workers to open personal retirement

accounts, shift control of health insurance to individuals and families, and give states more flexibility in managing Medicaid.”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press-releases/32/bob-barr-cites-need-for-budget-reform/>

Cost: Unknown.

Note: H.R. 6110, the Roadmap for America’s Future Act of 2008 (110<sup>th</sup> Congress): A bill to provide for the reform of health care, the Social Security system, the tax code for individuals and business, and the budget process. A cost estimate is not available.

#### D. Federal Government – Executive Office of the President:

“...What we’re going to do immediately, if I were president, when I become president in January 2009, is take that \$3.1 trillion federal budget and start paring it back. First of all, attack the executive office of the president, those discretionary spending items over which the president has control. You immediately institute at least a 10 percent cut across the board.”

<http://transcripts.cnn.com/TRANSCRIPTS/0805/14/gb.01.html>

Cost: -\$33 million (*savings*) (first-year cost).

Source: Total outlays for the Executive Office of President and its various offices (excluding the Iraq Relief and Reconstruction Fund) in FY 2008 are \$326 million. *Appendix, Budget of the United States Government: Fiscal Year 2009* (page 1055-1064).

<http://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/budget/fy2009/pdf/appendix/eop.pdf>

#### E. Tax Reform:

“‘[The United States] must both reduce and simplify taxes,’ [Barr] adds. That could mean replacing the income tax with a consumption tax. It could mean a low, flat income tax.”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press-releases/19/bob-barr-cites-anniversary-of-proposition-13-calls-for-new-tax-revolt/>

Cost: Unknown.

Note: An overhaul of the Tax Code that eliminates provisions relating to refundable credits could lead to significant savings. For example, implementation of the Fair Tax Act (introduced as H.R. 25 and S. 1025 in the 110<sup>th</sup> Congress) would lead to annualized savings of \$12.214 billion.

#### F. Welfare:

“... [W]e should consider creating a special tax credit for charitable giving, to provide Americans with a dollar-for-dollar tax reduction for money contributed to social services. We could then deduct an equivalent amount from the federal welfare budget. This would enable Americans to shift welfare from the public to the private sectors.”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press/press-releases/41/encourage-private-charitable->



giving-says-bob-barr/

Cost: Unknown.

**Fiscal Quotes:**

“Every area of federal spending can and should be cut. Entitlements must be reformed and welfare should be cut, including subsidies for business sometimes called corporate welfare. Military outlays should be reduced and pork barrel spending eliminated. Needless, duplicative, and wasteful programs, most of which have no constitutional basis, should be terminated.”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/issues/spending-economy/>

“... [T]he ultimate objective must be full privatization

<http://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2008/sep/06/border-first/>

with [Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac] turned into private companies, responsible for their loan portfolios, and without access to government guarantees or other forms of support.”

<http://www.bobbarr2008.com/press/press-rleases/56/bob-barr-says-privatize-fannie-mae-and-freddie-mac-end-government-subsidies/>