



Policy Proposals in the September 16th Republican Presidential Debate: Impact on Spending

Jeb Bush

Net Change in Spending per Year: \$71.718 billion

Homeland Security & Law Enforcement:

“And I laid out a comprehensive, conservative approach for immigration reform. And it does require securing the border.”

Cost per Year: \$17.8 billion (\$89 billion over five years)

Notes: Related legislation has been introduced in the form of S. 744 (113th Congress), the Border Security, Economic Opportunity, and Immigration Modernization Act. The bill would streamline and overhaul costs for the immigration system and increase border security and infrastructure. Using the Congressional Budget Office (CBO) [estimate](#), NTUF found that the bill would allocate additional funding for border-related administrative costs, double the number of Border Patrol agents (including their benefits, training, and forgiveness of student loans), and adjust fees and penalties that would offset some spending. The border security provisions of S. 744 would total \$18.4 billion over the first five years. This figure does not include the immigration-related spending in the bill. His campaign offered a “comprehensive” reform proposal very similar in outline to the additional immigration reforms included in S. 744, the full cost of which would require an additional \$71 billion over five years.

National Defense & Foreign Affairs:

“The first thing that we need to do is to stop the craziness of the [military] sequester.”

Cost per Year: \$53.918 billion (\$323.51 billion over six years)

Notes: In August 2015, CBO [estimated](#) that the automatic spending reductions specified in the Budget Control Act will reduce budget authority for discretionary defense spending by \$323.51 billion from FY 2016 through FY 2021.

“Rebuild our military so that our -- so that we don't deploy people over and over again without the necessary equipment to keep them safe, to send a signal to the world that we're serious. If we're going to lead the world, then we need to have the strongest military possible.”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: It is unclear from Governor Bush's statement how much additional funding his proposal would require.

"We need to rebuild our counterintelligence and intelligence capabilities."

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Note: It is unclear from Governor Bush's statement how much additional funding his proposal would require. Factors that could affect that amount include personnel, administrative, and equipment costs.

Ben Carson

Net Change in Spending per Year: \$3.8 billion

Economy:

"Well, first of all, let me say what I actually said about raising the minimum wage. I was asked should it be raised, I said, probably, or possibly. But, what I added, which I think is the most important thing, so, I said we need to get both sides of this issue to sit down, and talk about it. Negotiate a reasonable minimum wage, and index that so that we never have to have this conversation again in the history of America. I think we also have to have two minimum wages, a starter, and a sustaining because how are young people ever going to get a job if you have such a high minimum wage that it makes it impractical to hire them"

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: Related legislation was introduced during the 113th Congress in the form of S. 2223, the Minimum Wage Fairness Act. That bill would have gradually increased the federal minimum wage to \$10.10 and indexed it to inflation in years thereafter. CBO [determined](#) that the bill would not significantly impact federal outlays. It is unclear if this proposal would be scored similarly. In a related 2014 report, CBO noted that a minimum wage increase to \$10.10 would reduce total employment by about 500,000 workers.

Homeland Security & Law Enforcement:

"If we don't seal the border, the rest of this stuff clearly doesn't matter. It's kind of ridiculous all the other things we talk about. We have the ability to do it, we don't have the will to do it."

Cost per Year: \$3.7 billion (\$18.4 billion over five years)

Note: Related legislation has been introduced in the form of S. 744 (113th Congress), the Border Security, Economic Opportunity, and Immigration Modernization Act. The bill would streamline and overhaul costs for the immigration system and increase border security and infrastructure. Using the CBO [estimate](#), NTUF found that the bill would allocate additional funding for border-related administrative costs, double the number of Border Patrol agents (including their benefits, training, and forgiveness of student loans), and adjust fees and penalties that would offset some spending. The border security provisions of S. 744 would total \$18.4 billion over the first five years. This figure does not include the immigration-related spending in the bill.

"Well, what I said, after we seal the borders, after we turn off the spigot that dispenses all the goodies so we don't have people coming in here, we should consider allowing them to become guest workers, primarily in the agricultural sphere, because that's the place where Americans don't seem to want to work. That's what I said. And they have a six-month period to do that."

Cost per Year: \$102 million (\$509 million over five years)

Note: Related legislation has been introduced in the form of H.R. 1773, the Agricultural Guest Worker Act, in the 113th Congress. That bill would have increased the number of temporary visas available for agricultural workers. CBO [estimated](#) it would cost \$1.459 billion in the first five years after implementation. NTUF has excluded the entitlement-related spending in that estimate, which we assume (based on his statement) that Dr. Carson would prohibit. Our figure represents the average annual administrative costs after implementation.

National Defense & Foreign Affairs:

“There is no question that a lot of these problems that we have been talking about in terms of the international situation is because we are weak. It is because our Navy is so small. It is because our Air Force is incapable of doing the same things that it did a few years ago. ... [W]e need to build up our military”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Note: It is unclear from Dr. Carson’s statement how much additional funding his proposal would require.

Chris Christie

Net Change in Spending per Year: -\$5.622 billion

Energy:

“ Nuclear [energy] needs to be back on the table in a significant way in this country if we want to go after this problem [climate change].”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: It is unclear what policies would be implemented to promote nuclear energy development.

Government Reform:

“This government doesn’t need more money to make Social Security solvent. We need to be not paying out benefits to people who don’t really need it.”

Cost per Year: -\$6.222 billion (-\$31.11 billion over five years) *Partial Savings*

Note: As part of a broader [plan](#) to reform entitlement programs, Governor Christie has proposed establishing a means test for Social Security benefits. Current retirees would not be affected. Future retirees with incomes above \$80,000 would receive benefits on a sliding scale. Those earning \$200,000 or more would not receive any benefits under his plan. A [2011 study](#) from the Center for Economic and Policy Research indicated that eliminating Social Security benefits for those making over \$200,000 per year would result in savings of about 0.6 percent of Social Security outlays. Based on [data from the Congressional Budget Office](#), eliminating Social Security benefits for those earning over \$200,000 per year could save about \$6.2 billion per year over five years. An estimate for the phase-out is not currently available.

Homeland Security & Law Enforcement:

“What we need to do is to secure our border, and we need to do it with more than just a wall. We need to use electronics, we need to use drones, we need to use FBI, DEA, and ATF”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Note: According to the latest Selected Acquisition Report from the Department of Defense (published in December 2014), MQ-9 Reaper drones would cost about \$33.8 million per unit. The Department of Homeland Security cancelled construction of its SBInet “virtual” fencing system due to cost overruns, after it had spent over \$1 billion on just 35 miles of fence. It is unclear from Governor Christie’s statement how much additional FBI, DEA, and ATF involvement (and related funding) his proposal would require.

“... [W]e need to take the fingerprint of every person who comes into this country on a visa, and when they overstay their visa, we need to tap them on the shoulder, and say, ‘You have overstayed your welcome, you’re taking advantage of the American people. It’s time for you to go.’”

Cost per Year: \$600 million (First-year cost)

Note: Testimony presented before the Senate Judiciary Committee in 2013 [suggested](#) that expanding existing biometric entry/exit systems at U.S. air and sea ports could cost between \$400 million and \$600 million in the first year. The testimony noted that a \$10 increase in current visa processing fees could cover some or all of the costs. NTUF’s estimate reflects maximum potential impact on federal spending.

Ted Cruz

Net Change in Spending per Year: -\$92.633 billion

Government Reform:

“We’ll pass a simple flat tax and abolish the IRS.”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Note: The IRS’s FY 2016 funding is \$12 billion, including \$2.2 billion for taxpayer services, \$4.9 billion for enforcement, and \$3.7 billion for operations support. A simpler, flatter Tax Code would lead to administrative savings. In an interview with The Examiner in April, Cruz said he would shift the tracking and collection of federal taxes to “some much smaller division” of the Treasury Department. He also said, “We will roll it out with precise details in the coming weeks or months. There are trade-offs to be had and we’re right now internally having those debates, in terms of whether you have a couple of deductions or exemptions or not, at what rate the flat rate is set, what level of standard deductions and so those trade-offs we’re currently debating.”

Without additional details, the level of funding necessary to administer Senator Cruz’s reformed Tax Code is indeterminate.

Health Care:

“And through regulatory reform, we will repeal every word of Obamacare.”

Cost per Year: -\$95,400 (-\$477 billion over five years) Savings*

Note: A June 2015 CBO analysis of repealing the law showed that direct spending would be reduced by \$477 billion over five years. There are potentially additional unreported discretionary savings.

Homeland Security & Law Enforcement:

“You know, folks here have talked about, how do you secure the borders? Well, I’ve been leading the fight in the Senate to triple the Border Patrol”

Cost per Year: \$2.167 billion (\$10.834 billion over five years)

Note: In FY 2015 there were 7,539 full-time equivalents in Immigration and Customs Enforcement's Detention and Removal Operations division. The candidates have cited Congressional testimony stating that "only approximately 5,000 officers and agents within ICE perform the lion's share of ICE's immigration mission." H.R. 2278, the Strengthen and Fortify Enforcement Act (113th Congress) would have provided for the hiring of an additional 5,000 deportation officers, 700 support staff, and 60 trial attorneys at a [cost of \\$5.4 billion over five years](#). NTUF doubled this figure to determine the cost of tripling the number of ICE officers.

"Well, I've been leading the fight in the Senate to ... put in place fencings and walls"

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Note: It is unclear from Senator Cruz's statement how much or what type of additional fencing he would construct along the border. Construction costs per mile range from \$2 million to \$7 million.

"Well, I've been leading the fight to ... put in place a strong biometric exit/entry system... ."

Cost per Year: \$600 million (First-year cost)

Note: Testimony presented before the Senate Judiciary Committee in 2013 [suggested](#) that expanding existing biometric entry/exit systems at U.S. air and sea ports could cost between \$400 million and \$600 million in the first year. The testimony noted that a \$10 increase in current visa processing fees could cover some or all of the costs. NTUF's estimate reflects maximum potential impact on federal spending.

Carly Fiorina

Net Change in Spending per Year: \$43.783 billion

Homeland Security & Law Enforcement:

"We do need ... criminal justice reform. We have the highest incarceration rates in the world. Two-thirds of the people in our prisons are there for non-violent offenses, mostly drug related. It's clearly not working."

Cost per Year: -\$75 million (-\$376 million over five years) Savings

Notes: Related legislation was introduced in the 114th Congress in the form of S. 502, the Smarter Sentencing Act of 2015, which would reduce prison sentences for certain non-violent drug-related offenses. CBO [scored a previous version of the bill](#) in 2014 and found that it would lead to a net reduction in federal spending by \$376 million over five years.

National Defense & Foreign Affairs:

"What I would do, immediately, is begin rebuilding the Sixth Fleet"

Cost per Year: N/A

Note: Assumed to be included as part of a proposal to increase the overall number of Navy vessels listed below.

"What I would do, immediately, is ... I would begin rebuilding the missile defense program in Poland We could rebuild the missile defense program."

Cost per Year: \$780 million (\$3.9 billion over five years)

Note: In the 2009 Budget, the George W. Bush administration requested \$3.9 billion to establish interceptors in Poland. Later that year, the incoming Obama Administration announced that the plan would be scrapped. CBO also estimated the costs of expanding and operating an integrated missile defense system in Europe, including the sites in Poland that Mrs. Fiorina specifically mentioned, that could cost as much as \$15.11 billion over 20 years (after adjusting for inflation).

“We could give the Jordanians what they’ve asked for: bombs and material. We have not supplied it. I will. We could arm the Kurds. They’ve been asking us for three years. All of this is within our control.”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: Jordan: In February, Secretary of State John Kerry and the Jordanian Foreign Minister [signed a memorandum](#) of understanding to increase U.S. aid to Jordan by roughly \$400 million “which covers a wide range of programs in the areas of economic support, technical help, and security.” Kurds: H.R. 1735, the National Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Year 2016, would authorize at least \$90 million for the Kurdish Peshmerga to counter the Islamic State. The State Department indicated to The Huffington Post in June that the U.S. has indirectly sent at least \$365 million in military support to Iraqi Kurdistan. It is unclear what level of aid Fiorina would provide as President.

“We need the strongest military on the face of the planet, and everyone has to know it. And, specifically, what that means is we need about 50 Army brigades”

Cost per Year: \$17.93 billion (\$125.284 billion over five years)

Note: There are currently 32 Army brigades. In 2007, [CBO](#) estimated that increasing the Army’s force structure by two divisions, or an additional eight combat brigades, would cost up to \$90.8 billion over five years. Based on this figure, the level Mrs. Fiorina specified would cost about \$125.3 billion. NTUF assumes she would seek to reach that target over five years. NTUF accounted for inflation in this estimate.

“... [W]e need about 36 Marine battalions”

Cost per Year: \$8.863 billion (\$44.316 billion over five years)

Notes: There are currently 23 Marine battalions. President Obama’s FY 2012 Budget proposed to [eliminate six Marine combat battalions and four tactical air squadrons](#) for a [savings of \\$22.2 billion over five years](#). NTUF doubled that cost to estimate the cost of reaching Fiorina’s target, and assumed she would seek to reach that target over five years. NTUF accounted for inflation in this estimate.

“... [W]e need somewhere between 300 and 350 naval ships”

Cost per Year: \$16.285 billion (\$81.423 billion over five years)

Notes: The Congressional Research Service [noted in 2014](#) that there were 289 active ships in the Navy’s fleet. The Navy issued a report to Congress in April 2015 detailing its 30-year shipbuilding plan, which would result in a fleet of 308 ships. The plan would require \$81.423 billion over the first five years, an average of \$16.285 billion per Year.

“[W]e need to upgrade every leg of the nuclear triad”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: The Congressional Research Service indicated in a [2015 report](#) that the U.S. will spend \$89 billion over the next decade to modernize its nuclear arsenal. It is unclear from Mrs. Fiorina’s statement how she would alter those plans.

“[W]e need to reform the Department of Defense”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: It is unclear from Mrs. Fiorina’s statement how she would reform the Department.

“[W]e need as well to invest in our military technology”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: A February 2015 report from the Congressional Research Service notes that the research and development funding for the Department of Defense totalled \$63.9 billion in FY 2014. It is unclear what additional funding levels she would seek.

Veterans:

“... [W]e need to care for our veterans so 307,000 aren’t dying waiting for health care.”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: It is unclear from Mrs. Fiorina’s statement how she would reform the current veterans’ health care system.

Mike Huckabee

Net Change in Spending per Year: -\$19.282 billion

Government Reform:

“And it’s why I’m an unabashed supporter of the Fair Tax, which would be a tax on our consumption, rather than a tax on our productivity. ... Domestically, we would be operating under a tax system that eliminated the IRS.”

Cost per Year: -\$19.282 billion (-\$96.408 billion over five years) Savings

Notes: The estimate includes savings for the repeal of outlays related to refundable credits, phase-out of the Internal Revenue Service, and new spending for the establishment of a smaller successor organization to administer the rebates made available to households under the Fair Tax.

Health Care:

“And I would really believe that the next president ought to declare a war on cancer, heart disease, diabetes, and Alzheimer’s, because those are the four things that are causing the greatest level of cost. ... Why don’t we put a definitive focus scientifically on finding the cure for cancer, for heart disease, for diabetes and for Alzheimer’s”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: It is unclear from Governor Huckabee’s statement whether or how much additional federal funding he would support in order to carry out his proposal. The National Institutes of Health estimates that in FY 2016 it will spend \$5.6 billion on research related to cancer, \$1.3 billion on heart disease, \$1 billion on diabetes, and \$638 million on Alzheimer’s.

John Kasich

No quantifiable proposals.

Rand Paul

Net Change in Spending per Year: -\$75 million

Homeland Security & Law Enforcement:

“So I don’t think that the federal government should override the states [on drug legalization]. I believe in the 10th Amendment and I really will say that the states are left to themselves.”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: This could potentially lead to some budgetary savings but a cost estimate is unavailable.

“I would like to see more rehabilitation and less incarceration. I’m a fan of the drug courts which try to direct you back towards work and less time in jail.”

Cost per Year: -\$75 million (-\$376 million over five years) Savings

Notes: Related legislation was introduced in the 114th Congress in the form of S. 502, the Smarter Sentencing Act of 2015, which would reduce prison sentences for certain non-violent drug-related offenses. CBO [scored a previous version of the bill](#) in 2014 and found that it would lead to a net reduction in federal spending by \$376 million over five years.

National Defense & Foreign Affairs:

“The Kurds deserve to be armed and I’ll arm them.”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: H.R. 1735, the National Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Year 2016, would authorize at least \$90 million for the Kurdish Peshmerga to counter the Islamic State. The State Department indicated to The Huffington Post in June that the U.S. has indirectly sent at least \$365 million in military support to Iraqi Kurdistan. Senator Paul voted for an amendment that same month that would have authorized the U.S. government to directly aid the Kurds. The cost of such aid, and how much Senator Paul would provide as President, is unclear.

Marco Rubio

Net Change in Spending per Year: \$727 million

Homeland Security & Law Enforcement:

“First, we must -- we must secure our border, the physical border, with -- with a wall, absolutely.”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: It is unclear from Senator Rubio’s statement how much or what type of additional fencing he would construct along the border. Construction costs per mile range from \$2 million to \$7 million.

“But we also need to have an entry/exit tracking system.”

Cost per Year: \$600 million (First-year cost)

Note: Testimony presented before the Senate Judiciary Committee in 2013 [suggested](#) that expanding existing biometric entry/exit systems at U.S. air and sea ports could cost between \$400 million and \$600 million in the first year. The testimony noted that a \$10 increase in current visa processing fees could cover some or all of the costs. NTUF's estimate reflects maximum potential impact on federal spending.

“We also need a mandatory E-Verify system.”

Cost per Year: \$127 million (\$635 million over five years)

Notes: In 2013, CBO [reported](#) that a mandatory E-Verify system would cost \$635 million over five years.

National Defense & Foreign Affairs:

“If I'm honored with the opportunity to be president, I hope that our Air Force One will fly, first and foremost, to our allies”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: The most [recent data available](#) indicate that flying Air Force One costs \$206,337 per flight hour. NTUF has released several studies on the additional costs associated with Presidential travel abroad.

Donald Trump

Net Change in Spending per Year: \$87.831 billion

Health Care:

“We ... get rid of Obamacare”

Cost per Year: -\$95,400 (-\$477 billion over five years) Savings*

Note: A June 2015 CBO analysis of repealing the law showed that direct spending would be reduced by \$477 billion over five years. There are potentially additional unreported discretionary savings.

Homeland Security & Law Enforcement:

“First of all, I want to build a wall, a wall that works.”

Cost per Year: \$2.52 billion (\$12.6 billion over five years)

Notes: Border fence construction costs up to \$6.5 million per mile. Completing fencing across the remaining 1,283 miles of the border, could [cost upwards of \\$8.3 billion](#). Following through on previous statutory goals requiring an additional 663.7 miles of double-layer fencing could add another \$4.3 billion to the total cost. NTUF assumes Trump will prioritize and expedite the construction in order to complete the project within five years.

“Second of all, we have a lot of really bad dudes in this country from outside ... They go, if I get elected, first day they're gone.”

Cost per Year: \$5.049 billion (\$25.245 billion over five years)

Notes: This is a partial cost estimate. NTUF [analyzed](#) Trump's full immigration reform platform, which included a tripling of the number of Immigration and Customs Enforcement agents (\$10.834 billion over five years), and support for detaining and deporting illegal aliens. The latter two proposals match with legislation offered in Congress. H.R. 2278 (114th Congress) would provide grants to the states for incarceration of illegal aliens, and would allow states to seek reimbursement from the federal government for transportation, at a combined cost of \$14.412 billion over five years. Subsequently, Trump declared he would seek to deport all illegal aliens within two years. It is unclear what additional funding would be necessary to achieve that timetable.

National Defense & Foreign Affairs:

“We rebuild our military”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: It is unclear from his statement to what extent Mr. Trump would rebuild or expand the military.

Scott Walker

Net Change in Spending per Year: -\$57.458 billion

Education:

“That’s the way you help people create jobs. It’s part of our large plan ... to put in place an education system that gives people the skills and education that they need.”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: It is not immediately clear how Walker’s education proposal might impact federal spending.

Energy:

“To put in place an all of the above energy policy”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: It is unclear whether Governor Walker’s pursuit of such a strategy would require more or less federal funding.

Government Reform:

“That’s the way you help people create jobs. It’s part of our large plan to reform the Tax Code, to cut taxes”

Cost per Year: Indeterminate

Notes: Governor Walker’s proposal to reform the Tax Code could result in administrative savings, though the extent of those would depend on how he implements his reforms.

Health Care:

“I’m the only one on this stage that’s actually got a plan, introduced an actual plan to repeal Obamacare on day one.”

Cost per Year: -\$95,400 (-\$477 billion over five years) Savings

Note: A June 2015 CBO analysis of repealing the law showed that direct spending would be reduced by \$477 billion over five years. There are potentially additional unreported discretionary savings.

“I’ll send a [health care] bill up to Congress, and ... enact it”

Cost per Year: \$37.942 billion (\$187.71 billion)

Notes: Walker’s [plan](#) would replace the so-called Affordable Care Act with refundable credits based on age for the purchase of health insurance (\$226 billion over ten years), a refundable credit for Health Savings Accounts (\$53 billion over five years) the establishment of high-risk pools for individuals with pre-existing conditions (\$7.5 billion per Year) a proposal to permit the purchase of health insurance across state lines ([\\$191 million](#) over five years, inflation adjusted), and support for wellness programs (indeterminate cost). The plan also includes reforms for Medicaid (indeterminate cost), long-term services (related to regulation), and health care related litigation (savings of [\\$18.3 billion](#) over five year). Walker’s plan is based on a proposal by the 2017 Project. Except where noted above, estimates are from a [score](#) of the plan completed by the Center for Health and Economy.

Notes:

Text of candidates’ quotations are as reported in a printed [transcript](#).

* The candidate did not specify what policies would be used to replace the Affordable Care Act.